

referee 1:

formal improvements suggested, but "makes a substantial contribution to understanding of H-mode physics in helical devices, fully corresponds to NF subjects and, undoubtedly, is worthy to be published there."

referee 2: (8 lines of comments only):

"essentially a review" + more thorough comparison with Tokamaks required:

- > radial force balance $E_r \sim \text{grad}(\pi)/n$ in fully developed H-mode
- > H-mode OP-range at low densities (W7AS)

editor:

"feels the paper lacks novelty" - "not suitable for publication in Nuclear Fusion." as too review-like

MHirsch (letter to editor) considering comments Teresa, Tsuyoshi

..
"As a survey on H-modes in helical devices it can neither contain new results - they are / should be published individually - nor be a review, as the field of H-modes in 3D devices is developing too rapidly that a review paper makes sense at this time".

editor " ... your concerns will be passed on to the Board."

MHirsch: ... a resubmission correcting only the referees concerns makes no sense

... a resubmission correcting only the referees concerns makes no sense
- but an improved version ...

3D related improved edge confinement and H-modes in helical devices ??
-> to PPCF ? until end 2011 ?

The lines which could be followed are our main theses (are to be tested and discussed)

- > compare **OP-range** (edge pressure gradient, edge T_e) with Tokamak (limiter) H-mode
- > test various theories on **configuration (iota) dependence** in low-shear devices versus existing data
- > **neoclassical radial electric field** observations and peculiarities in 3D
- > the (sudden) **classical H-mode transition** on top of **E_r shear development**